

Trudo Lemmens, LicJur, LLM (bioethics), DCL Schoil Chair in Health Law & Policy Associate Professor Faculty of Law, University of Toronto 39 Queen's park Toronto, ON, Canada M5S 2C3 Tel: 416-978 4201 Fax: 416-946 3744 Trudo.Lemmens@utoronto.ca

President Eric Kaler (Chair), Professor Eva von Dassow (Vice-Chair), and Senators of the University of Minnesota Senate University of Minnesota 427 Morrill Hall 100 Church St SE Minneapolis, MN 55455

December 11, 2013,

## Re: Markingson Case and Independent Inquiry

Dear President Kaler, Professor von Dassow, and Members of the Senate,

We welcome the Senate's recent recommendation of an Independent Inquiry. Given the flawed nature of previous inquiries—a key factor identified in our previous correspondence—we believe that the new Inquiry must be thorough and its integrity impeccable.

To this end we urge you to ensure that the investigation covers the problems in the Markingson case and examines whether other similar cases exist. Without such an evaluation of how research is and has been conducted 'on the ground', there will be remaining concerns whether research subjects are properly protected. The Independent Committee needs to receive the necessary authority and a wide mandate to look at specific past and present research practices, procedures and guidelines, and the reaction of the University when things go wrong. Such an evaluation will require that the University fully cooperate with the Committee, providing access to all relevant documents, solving legal hurdles that may exist, and enabling interviews with all relevant witnesses, with protection of their identity when required.

We respectfully suggest that the committee receive substantive input from individuals who have been explicitly asking for a further investigation, and that the selection of Committee members not be controlled by those who have been the target of criticism in relation to the controversies that will be investigated. Many scholars who have signed these letters would be willing to provide their support in establishing the committee and selecting independent and credible committee members.

Ensuring full support from all sides in the establishment of the Inquiry, and enabling the investigation of past and current research practices, are essential for the legitimacy of the process and ultimate report. It is important to get it right this time.

Yours sincerely,

Trudo Lemmens, LLM/IDCL

Scholl Chair in Health Law and Policy

Faculty of Law and Faculty of Medicine, University of Toronto

Toronto, Ontario

PIP

Raymond De Vries, PhD

Professor

Center for Bioethics and Social Sciences in Medicine

University of Michigan Medical School

Ann-Arbor, Michigan

Alice Dreger, PhD

Professor

Medical Humanities and Bioethics Program

Northwestern University Feinberg School of Medicine

Chicago, Illinois

Lois Shepherd, JD

Peter A. Wallenborn, Jr. and Dolly F. Wallenborn Professor of Biomedical Ethics; Professor of Public

Health Sciences, Professor of Law

University of Virginia, Virginia

Susan M. Reverby, PhD

Marion Butler McLean Professor in the History of Ideas and Professor of Women's and Gender Studies

Wellesley College

Wellesley, Massachusetts

Jerome P. Kassirer, M.D.

Distinguished Professor

Tufts University School of Medicine

Boston, Massachusetts